

A Tax on Sweetened Beverages A Very Brief Public Health Ethics Case

September 2016

This short document presents a case study comprising a scenario and material to stimulate further reflection. We originally produced this case for use during a workshop held in May 2016.¹ We have adapted this and other cases and republished them together so that they might be used in combination with the summary versions of ethics frameworks for public health that we have produced to date. They are intended to give public health practitioners some material for practice in ethical deliberation.

Case

You represent your public health unit on the Regional Food Policy Council, whose mission is to track the food system's functioning in your area, and to "provide ideas, actions, and policy recommendations on how to improve it" (Mendes, 2011, p. 1). A council member from a local non-profit wants it to recommend that the provincial (or territorial) government implement a tax on sugary drinks to help slow the increase in overweight and obesity. Part of the tax revenues would go towards the *Healthy Corner Store Initiative*, which would put affordable healthy foods in selected corner stores, particularly in food deserts and in remote locations. The rest of the tax revenues would go to balancing provincial or territorial and municipal budgets.

Instructions

Through deliberation, please:

- Identify the ethical issues that arise in this case.
- Make a decision about whether your health unit should
 - Support this proposal
 - Support a modified version of the proposal
 - Reject this proposal / propose an alternative.
- Give reasons for your decisions.



Figure 1 'Lid'

Photo credit: Dean Hochman (<https://www.flickr.com/>)

Licence: Creative Commons

(<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/2.0/>)

Some considerations

THE CANADIAN CONTEXT

- Between 1985 and 2011, the prevalence of overweight and obesity among Canadian adults rose from 34% (1985) to 52% (2011) (Twells et al., 2014).
- It is estimated that 55% of Canadian adults will be overweight or obese by 2019 (Twells et al., 2014).
- A first decrease has recently been observed in overweight and obesity prevalence among Canadian children, going from 30% (2004) to 27% (2013) (Rodd & Sharma, 2016).
- In 2015, Canadians purchased on average 88.1 litres of sweetened beverages per person, placing Canada in 10th place among the countries with the highest per-capita sweetened beverage sales (Arsenault, 2016).
- Between 2010 and 2015, sweetened beverage sales in Canada diminished by 10.3 litres per person (Arsenault, 2016).
- Less socioeconomically advantaged persons tend to consume more sweetened beverages than do more advantaged persons (Le Bodo, 2015).

¹ The PowerPoint is available online at:
http://www.ncchpp.ca/128/Presentations.ccnpps?id_article=1556



HEALTH EFFECTS

- The regular consumption of sweetened beverages is associated with, notably, overweight and obesity, type 2 diabetes and dental caries (Imamura et al., 2015; Scharf & De Boer, 2016).

EXAMPLE OF A TAX ON SWEETENED BEVERAGES

- In Mexico, a tax of about 10% on sweetened beverages has been in place since January 2014. One year after the tax was implemented, sales of sweetened beverages were down by 12% overall, and down by 17% among more socioeconomically disadvantaged persons (Colchero et al., 2016).

References

- Arsenault, B. (2016). The International Chair on Cardiometabolic Risk Global Sugar-Sweetened Beverage Sale Barometer. *Editorials*, 31 may 2016. Retrieved from: <http://www.myhealthywaist.org/editorials/full-text/comm/2221/3/index.html>
- Colchero, M. A., Popkin, B. M., Rivera, J. A., & Ng, S. W. (2016). Beverage purchases from stores in Mexico under the excise tax on sweetened beverages: observational study. *BMJ*, 352. Retrieved from: <http://www.bmj.com/content/352/bmj.h6704>
- Imamura, F., O'Connor, L., Ye, Z., Mursu, J., Hayashino, Y., Bhupathiraju, S. N., & Forouhi, N. G. (2015). Consumption of sugar sweetened beverages, artificially sweetened beverages, and fruit juice and incidence of type 2 diabetes: systematic review, meta-analysis, and estimation of population attributable fraction. *BMJ*, 351. Retrieved from: <http://www.bmj.com/content/351/bmj.h3576>

- Le Bodo, Y. (2015). *Taxation des boissons sucrées*. Presentation at the JASP conference during a workshop entitled 'Faut-il protéger les gens contre eux-mêmes', December 9, 2015. Retrieved from: https://www.inspq.qc.ca/sites/default/files/jasp/archives/2015/JASP2015_ProtegeGens_YLeBodo.pdf
- Mendes, W. (2011). *Food Policy Councils*. Montréal: National Collaborating Centre for Healthy Public Policy. Retrieved from: http://www.ncchpp.ca/148/publications.ccnpps?id_article=664
- Rodd, C. & Sharma, A. K. (2016). Recent trends in the prevalence of overweight and obesity among Canadian children. *Canadian Medical Association Journal*. Retrieved from: <http://www.cmaj.ca/content/early/2016/05/09/cmaj.150854>
- Scharf, R. J. & DeBoer, M. D. (2016). Sugar-Sweetened Beverages and Children's Health. *Annual Review of Public Health*, 37, 273-293. Retrieved from: http://www.annualreviews.org/doi/full/10.1146/annurev-publhealth-032315-021528?url_ver=Z39.88-2003&rft_id=ori%3Arid%3Acrossref.org&rft_d at=cr_pub%3Dpubmed&
- Twells, L. K., Gregory, D. M., Reddigan, J., & Midodzi, W. K. (2014). Current and predicted prevalence of obesity in Canada: a trend analysis. *Canadian Medical Association Journal*, 2(1). Retrieved from: <http://pubmedcentralcanada.ca/pmcc/articles/PMC3985909/?jsessionid=D8D518898BCE2E7AF73828245011657C.eider?lang=en-ca>

Questions or comments?

Michael Keeling: michael.keeling@inspq.qc.ca

Olivier Bellefleur: olivier.bellefleur@inspq.qc.ca

The National Collaborating Centre for Healthy Public Policy (NCCHPP) seeks to increase the expertise of public health actors across Canada in healthy public policy through the development, sharing and use of knowledge. The NCCHPP is one of six centres financed by the Public Health Agency of Canada. The six centres form a network across Canada, each hosted by a different institution and each focusing on a specific topic linked to public health. In addition to the Centres' individual contributions, the network of Collaborating Centres provides focal points for the exchange and common production of knowledge relating to these topics. The National Collaborating Centre for Healthy Public Policy is hosted by the Institut national de santé publique du Québec (INSPQ), a leading centre in public health in Canada.

Production of this document has been made possible through a financial contribution from the Public Health Agency of Canada through funding for the National Collaborating Centre for Healthy Public Policy (NCCHPP). The views expressed herein do not necessarily represent the views of the Public Health Agency of Canada.

All images in this document have been reproduced with permission or in accordance with licences authorizing their reproduction. Should you discover any errors or omissions, please advise us at ncchpp@inspq.qc.ca.

Information contained in the document may be cited provided that the source is mentioned.